

PRESERVATION PLAN

HISTORIC DESIGNATION

In addition to the documentation of Muir College history and building integrity, the Preservation Plan evaluated the historic resources according to the standards required for historic designation. The standards used were those for designation on the National Register of Historic Places and the California Register of Historic Places. The resources appear to be eligible for designation based on the Statement of Significance.

Properties may be listed as individual buildings or as a district. Muir College appears to be eligible either as a district or with each of its buildings as individual resources.

National and State Registers

The legal basis for historic designation is based on federal and state legislation. The National Historic Preservation Act of 1966 (NHPA) created the National Register, which is the national inventory of known historic resources in the country. It also authorized the creation of state registers, which each state can hold for significant properties in addition to nationally-recognized sites. Properties that are deemed historically significant must be found to meet standards of integrity and fulfill at least one of the Criteria of Significance (see Statement of Significance). Properties listed on the National Register are automatically eligible for designation at the state level, but the reverse is not necessarily true. Properties that are not eligible for the National Register because of a loss of integrity, or more limited significance, can be listed on the state register.

Effects of Designation

Once properties are designated to be included on the National Register, any addition or alteration to the property must be completed in accordance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*. The ten *Standards* are not technical or regulatory, but intended to achieve responsible preservation practices and consistency of the work. If the site is listed as a district, the integrity of the entire district must be considered if any changes are to occur. Additionally, under Section 106 of the NHPA, historic properties listed on the National Register must be evaluated in the event that a federal project could have an impact upon an individual property or district.

In California, the state Office of Historic Preservation (OHP), which is overseen by the State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO), completes these evaluations. The office oversees architectural review and the issuance of tax incentives, as well as administering the California Register of Historic Places. A property listed on the state register requires that it may be considered under environmental review by the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Any action having a potential adverse effect on the resource must also be reviewed by the OHP.

MUIR COLLEGE HISTORIC CAMPUS CORE

The central area of John Muir College and its distinctive buildings are an important collection of buildings relevant to the history of the university. It is recommended that this be deemed an historic area for purposes of internal campus planning and facilities decisions, and so that the community may recognize the historic value of the place.

The boundaries of this campus core correspond to the original boundaries of the academic and residential components of the Muir campus as it was originally planned. Additionally, they are in keeping with National Register guidelines which state that district boundaries must “encompass the single area of land containing the significant concentration of buildings, sites, structures, or objects making up the district” without including “buffer zones or acreage not directly

contributing to the significance of the property.”

The proposed boundary reflects the clusters of historic resources, the historical uses of the site, the spatial organization, response to the natural environment, and the circulation networks established during the period of significance. The area within the proposed district boundaries represents the “significant concentration” of related natural and man-made historic resources that define a historic district according to National Register guidelines.

In the event that a new building is constructed or the circulation is altered, it should be noted as distinct from this original group.



The Historic Campus Core of John Muir College would be eligible for an Historic District based on its cohesive architecture. This refers to the approximately 11 acre central campus of Muir College, not including facilities outside the boundary edge.

Integrity

Integrity is the authenticity of a historical resource's physical identity evidenced by the survival of characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. A common test of integrity is whether a contemporary would recognize the building, site or historic district. In order to be listed on an historic register, a property must both meet one or more of significance criteria listed above and must also possess a majority of the seven aspects of historic integrity: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. An eligible resource will exhibit most of these aspects of integrity although the elements that are most important will vary with the property type and with the historic context that defines the resource's significance. For a district to retain integrity as a whole, the majority of the components that comprise the district's historic character must possess integrity.

In general, Muir College retains a very high level of historic integrity with respect to its architectural significance. Buildings within the historic campus core retain an especially high degree of integrity when viewed as a group. This grouping of academic resources retains the integrity of location, setting, design, workmanship, materials, feeling, and association necessary to be considered historic district contributors.

The individual components that comprise the historic campus core retain high levels of integrity. These include individual academic buildings and student residences, the designed open spaces, original circulation patterns, outdoor courtyards and covered walkways. Virtually none of the buildings that contribute to the historic district have had exterior alterations which would diminish individual integrity. With regard to interiors, many interior spaces retain a very high level of original historic material. Some specific academic departments have been relocated over time resulting in interior modifications but these have been relatively limited over time and range from minor to moderate. All buildings retain their original uses. The original, designed circulation routes remain heavily used and are intact, as are the original courtyards and quads. Overall, the Muir College historic campus core retains a very high level of integrity; the individual components continue to convey their original use and historic associations. Together these resources retain a strong sense of time and place.

PRESERVATION STRATEGIES

The following seven goals represent the preservation strategies to be applied to the plan, based on research and the understood goals of the University of California, San Diego (UCSD). Recommendations are identified under each goal to facilitate policy development and implementation. It is recommended that UCSD incorporate these preservation strategies into existing planning and capital improvement procedures.

Goal 1 Sensitive Maintenance of Historic Buildings and Protection of Character Defining Features

A major attribute that qualifies the buildings of John Muir College as historical resources is their relatively low degree of alteration and the high degree of integrity of the buildings individually and of the campus as an historic district. However, time and climatic elements have caused deterioration of the buildings. To retain the integrity of the resources, the preservation strategy should address building maintenance. The greatest threat to the buildings' future is deferred maintenance to the exterior and alterations without appropriate historical review.

Recommendations:

- 1) Recognize the historic campus core of Muir College. Include this distinction and corresponding recommendations and treatment in subsequent planning policy for the college.
- 2) Create action plan to immediately address buildings with exterior deterioration. Conduct periodic assessments of historic buildings to check for deteriorating materials.
- 3) Understand character-defining features of buildings that represent design intent of architects. Prioritize these as items of special attention for preservation in any renovations.
- 4) UCSD should develop material palette for use in maintenance and alterations so that they may be done with sensitivity to historic materials. Consult qualified material and conservation specialists to execute these plans.
- 5) Maintain current building configuration that continues the design intent established in the Muir College Master Plan, which was revised by Robert Mosher in 1965. Considerations should include the relationship to each other, relationship to the human scale, honesty of materials, a consistent architectural vocabulary, and the expression of internal function.

- 6) A redesign of building interiors should not be completed without first determining that the existing interior circulation, spatial organization, and finishes be evaluated for historic sensitivity. Any new materials should be complementary to materials used at the date of earliest construction, when possible.
- 7) Prior to any changes, existing conditions should be well documented so that past history is known.
- 8) Proposed projects should be carried out in accordance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*.

Goal 2 Preserve and Enhance the Campus Landscape Plan

Equally significant to the built environment of John Muir College is the landscape architecture and planting strategy that unites it all. The landscape plan for plantings and pavings was meant to be consistent across all of John Muir College and has remained largely unchanged. Although adherence to this plan has diminished through the years on a campus-wide scale, the essence of the original landscape remains at John Muir College. It is essential that existing softscape and hardscape is retained, as it is relatively unaltered from its original state. Future maintenance and additions should not detract from the consistent character that the landscape plan provides for the college and the University as a whole.

Recommendations:

- 1) Replace existing plants, when appropriate, with those specified in original landscape site improvement drawings, planting plans, and Muir Master Plan to maintain similar appearance with historic plantings.
- 2) Maintain existing paving, circulation routes, sidewalks, pathways, and raised planters with similar materials, scoring patterns, and relationship to buildings
- 3) Incorporate a sympathetically designed and energy-efficient lighting scheme that highlights the character-defining features of the Muir College landscape.

Goal 3 Integrate Value of History into College Identity

The history of the development of UCSD and John Muir College is vastly important to the spirit of the University. This knowledge should be provided to every student, and the students must have access to this knowledge to appreciate it. An essential part of the preservation plan should be the dissemination of knowledge to the student body through printed materials, courses, and environmental graphics. This will better integrate the value of the college throughout the entire campus, including students, faculty, staff, and local San Diegans.

Recommendations:

- 1) Acknowledge boundaries of the historic campus core of Muir College. Introduce signage program that highlights architectural history of the campus and contributing historic buildings and landscapes.
- 2) Include history of Muir College buildings and architecture in introductory materials for beginning students to further their understanding of surrounding built environment.
- 3) Continue seminar instruction on architectural heritage at Muir College in curriculum to encourage student appreciation for built environment and preservation issues.
- 4) Make preservation plan available to students, visitors, and community on Muir College and UCSD website.

Goal 4 Preserve Documentation Related to Muir College History

The physical documentation related to the establishment of the College, maps, drawings, correspondence, files, etc. is fragile and is located in various sites. Assemblage of drawings on FacilitiesLink at UCSD is an excellent resource, but its holdings could be enhanced by adding more search fields and making the interface more user-friendly. For example, adding the ability to search by architect or landscape architect would be useful. Current file systems are not dedicated to Muir College, specifically. Creating a Muir College archive, including drawings, photographs, and correspondence, would result in a valuable comprehensive resource for the college.

Recommendations:

- 1) Inventory, preserve and utilize all pertinent information to create an archive of as-built and historic drawings and documents.
- 2) Maintain this archive and make the collection available to students, faculty and the facilities and maintenance departments especially when alterations to specific buildings are required.

Goal 5 Highlight San Diego Architectural History

The buildings of John Muir College are an invaluable piece of the historic building inventory of San Diego. However, the City lacks appropriate recognition of that heritage in printed materials. The Muir Preservation Plan will ensure not only that these individual buildings are maintained, but it will be a resource for documenting the architectural history of the City.

Recommendations:

- 1) Create partnership with San Diego Architecture Foundation, San Diego Historical Society, and Visitors Bureau to disperse knowledge. Include online and paper resources on Muir architecture at Muir and San Diego Historical Society.
- 2) Investigate opportunity to host formal semipermanent exhibit on Muir architecture at local museum or on campus.
- 3) Include John Muir College as part of heritage tourism of the City of San Diego. Use Charlottesville, VA, as model; they include University of Virginia campus tour on the front page of their tourism website.

Goal 6 Align Preservation Strategies with Existing Campus Plans

The Reville and Muir Colleges Neighborhoods Planning Study, completed in 2007, studied the existing form of the buildings and landscape of Reville and Muir Colleges and created Design Guidelines for future buildings. Additionally, several books and published documents account the history of planning at UCSD. However, neither of these documents contains strategies for preservation implementation. The present preservation plan should compile the knowledge and studies of the past and transform those ideas into implementable policies.

Recommendations:

- 1) Continue internal planning process that highlights character of individual colleges and ensures that their development patterns, architectural style, and character are celebrated and maintained.
- 2) Incorporate Muir Preservation Plan into future neighborhood planning study for Muir College.

Goal 7 Encourage High-quality, Contextual Design

Muir College possesses a high level of character and identity established by the historic district campus components. As students' needs change, population grows, and technology advances, it will be necessary to add to or alter the buildings. New construction should be executed with the highest attention to cohesive design that will not detract from the campus character. Present efforts at Muir College, such as the design of the Muir Apartments project in 2008, have already made campus cohesiveness a priority, which sets an excellent example for the future.

Recommendations:

- 1) Buildings should employ similar architectural vocabulary appropriate for academic or residential buildings. Designers can consult Design Guidelines established in 2007 *Revelle and Muir Colleges Neighborhoods Planning Study*, completed by UCSD's Office of Physical Planning.
- 2) Attention to intended circulation, open space, and orientation of buildings to the public realm should be included in building design.
- 3) The Design Review Board (DRB) at UCSD should review any design for buildings proposed at Muir College.
- 4) To the extent possible, continue to engage and involve the original Muir College architects in the designing of new buildings, as was done with Muir Apartments project in 2008.

